

Bail Reform, Judicial Implicit Bias, and Risk Assessments

Speakers: Brandon Buskey, Director of Smart Justice Litigation, Criminal Law Reform Project, American Civil Liberties Union, New York; Andrea Woods, Staff Attorney, Criminal Law Reform Project, American Civil Liberties Union, New York; Theresa Doyle, Judge, King County Superior Court

Materials:

Pretrial Reform Generally

1. Jennifer Gonnerman, *Kalief Browder: 1993-2015*, *The New Yorker* (June 7, 2015), available at <https://www.newyorker.com/news/news-desk/kalief-browder-1993-2015>.
2. Nick Pinto, *The Bail Trap*, *New York Times Magazine* (August 13, 2015), available at <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/08/16/magazine/the-bail-trap.html>.
3. Video: *Lavette's Choice* <https://youtu.be/E0LFFXt5D0E>
 - a. *Related blog: Zave Martohardjono, Lavette's Choice* (Feb. 8, 2018) <https://www.aclu.org/blog/smart-justice/lavettes-choice>
4. Peter Wagner and Wendy Sawyer, *Mass Incarceration: The Whole Pie 2018* Prison Policy Initiative (March 14, 2018), available at <https://www.prisonpolicy.org/reports/pie2018.html>.
5. Video: *The Truth About Bail* <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ucUfj3IRA8>.
6. *Pretrial Policy: State Laws*: National Conference of State Legislatures, available at <http://www.ncsl.org/research/civil-and-criminal-justice/pretrial-policy-search-by-state.aspx>.
7. Melissa Neal, *Bail Fail: Why the U.S. Should End the Practice of Using Money for Bail*, Justice Policy Institute (Sept. 2012), available at <http://www.justicepolicy.org/uploads/justicepolicy/documents/bailfail.pdf>.
8. Judge Theresa Doyle, *Fixing the Money Bail System*, *King County Bar Bulletin* (April 2016), available at <https://www.courts.wa.gov/subsite/mjc/docs/FixingtheMoneyBailSystem.pdf>.
9. Erwin Chemerinsky, *Bail reform is overdue in California. Here's a better, fairer, safer way*, *Sacramento Bee* (March 19, 2018), available at <https://www.sacbee.com/opinion/california-forum/article205884969.html>.
10. Timothy R. Schnacke, *Money as a Criminal Justice Stakeholder: The Judge's Decision to Release or Detain a Defendant Pretrial*, National Inst. of Corrections (Sept. 2014), available at <https://s3.amazonaws.com/static.nicic.gov/Library/029517.pdf>.
11. Pretrial Justice Institute, *The State of Pretrial Justice in America* (November 2017), available at <https://university.pretrial.org/HigherLogic/System/DownloadDocumentFile.ashx?DocumentFileKey=f9d452f6-ac5a-b8e7-5d68-0969abd2cc82&forceDialog=0>.

12. Jason Tashea, *Text-message reminders are a cheap and effective way to reduce pretrial detention*, ABA Journal (July 17, 2018), available at http://www.abajournal.com/lawscribbler/article/text_messages_can_keep_people_out_of_jail.
13. Shima Baradaran Baughman and Frank McIntyre, *Predicting Violence*, 90 Tex. L. Rev. 497 (March 2012), available at https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1756506.
14. Timothy R. Schnacke, “Model” Bail Laws: Re-Drawing the Line Between Pretrial Release and Detention (April 2017), available at http://www.clebp.org/images/04-18-2017_Model_Bail_Laws_CLEPB_.pdf.
15. Laura Binczewski, *Lucas County, Ohio: A Case Study in Fixing America’s Broken Jails*, The Crime Report (July 12, 2018), available at <https://thecrimereport.org/2018/07/12/lucas-county-ohio-a-case-study-in-fixing-americas-broken-jails/#>.
16. Donald W. Meyers, *Study: No significant crime increase under Yakima County pretrial program*, Yakima Herald (Nov. 25, 2017), available at https://www.yakimaherald.com/news/crime_and_courts/study-no-significant-crime-increase-under-yakima-county-pretrial-program/article_dc87b8e4-d274-11e7-8969-239a1b1de844.html.
17. Supreme Court of Kentucky, *Authorization for the Non-Financial Uniform Schedule of Bail Administrative Release Program* (2017), available at <https://university.pretrial.org/HigherLogic/System/DownloadDocumentFile.ashx?DocumentFileKey=f91f6b90-93c3-c765-cd86-76ab26b9f72f&forceDialog=0>.

Social Costs of Pretrial Detention

18. Arpit Gupta, Christopher Hansman, and Ethan Frenchman, *The Heavy Costs of High Bail: Evidence from Judge Randomization* (August 5, 2016). Journal of Legal Studies, Vol. 45, No. 2, 2016, available at <http://www.columbia.edu/~cjh2182/GuptaHansmanFrenchman.pdf>.
19. Paul Heaton et al., *The Downstream Consequences of Misdemeanor Pretrial Detention*, 69 Stan. L. Rev. 711 (2017), available at <https://www.stanfordlawreview.org/print/article/the-downstream-consequences-of-misdemeanor-pretrial-detention/>.
20. Megan Stevenson, *Distortion of Justice: How the Inability to Pay Bail Affects Case Outcomes* (2017), available at https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2777615&download=yes.
21. Alex Holsinger, *Exploring the Relationship Between Time in Pretrial Detention and Four Outcomes*. Crime and Justice Institute (2016), available at http://www.crj.org/assets/2017/07/12_Exploring_Pretrial_Detention.pdf.

22. Christopher T. Lowenkamp, Marie VanNostrand, & Alexander Holsinger, Laura & John Arnold Found., *The Hidden Costs of Pretrial Detention* (2013), available at https://www.arnoldfoundation.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/LJAF_Report_hidden-costs_FNL.pdf.

Implicit Racial Bias

23. Jeffrey J. Rachlinski et al., *Does Unconscious Racial Bias Affect Trial Judges?* 84 Notre Dame L. Rev. 1195 (2009), available at <https://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=1&ved=2ahUKEwi2qtbnp8rcAhWUKn0KHbHPDwEQFjAAegQIABAC&url=http%3A%2F%2Fscholarship.law.cornell.edu%2Fcgi%2Fviewcontent.cgi%3Farticle%3D1691%26context%3Dfacpub&usg=AOvVaw1lhBWey4WGo-f6QEMy8U69&httpsredir=1&article=1691&context=facpub>.
24. Andrew Kahn and Chris Kirk, *What It's Like to Be Black in the Criminal Justice System*, Slate (Aug. 9, 2015), available at http://www.slate.com/articles/news_and_politics/crime/2015/08/racial_disparities_in_the_criminal_justice_system_eight_charts_illustrating.html.
25. David Arnold, et al., *Racial Bias in Bail Decisions*, Nat'l Bureau of Econ. Research Working Paper No. 23421 (May 2017), available at <https://www.nber.org/papers/w23421>.

Emerging Case Law

26. *In re Kenneth Humphrey*, 19 Cal. App. 5th 1006 (Cal. App. Jan. 25, 2018).
27. *In re Christopher Lee White*, 21 Cal. App. 5th 18 (Cal. App. March 6, 2018).
28. Bob Egelko and Evan Sernoffsky, *State Supreme Court to review landmark case on money bail system*, San Francisco Chronicle (May 23, 2018), available at <https://www.sfchronicle.com/news/article/State-Supreme-Court-to-review-landmark-case-on-12938615.php>.
29. *ODonnell v. Harris County*, 892 F.3d 147 (5th Cir. June 1, 2018).
30. *Burks v. Scott County, Mississippi*, Case No. 3:14-cv-00745-HTW-LRA (June 27, 2017), available at https://www.aclu.org/sites/default/files/field_document/scott_county_judgment.pdf.
31. Rhonda Cook, *ACLU sues Glynn County for jailing the poor over minor offenses*, Atlanta Journal Constitution (May 9, 2018), available at <https://www.myajc.com/news/aclu-sues-glynn-county-for-jailing-poor/Ovb8FB6NdYUdXz7nwWKPdK/>.
32. Jolie McCullough, *Poor inmates sue Dallas County over bail system following Harris County ruling*, Texas Tribune (Jan. 22, 2018), available at <https://www.texastribune.org/2018/01/22/following-harris-county-ruling-poor-inmates-sue-dallas-county-over-bai/>.

33. Michael Barajas, *Galveston Lawsuit is Writing on the Wall for Other Counties that Haven't Ended "Wealth-Based Detention"* Texas Observer (Apr. 10, 2018), available at <https://www.texasobserver.org/galveston-lawsuit-is-writing-on-the-wall-for-other-counties-that-havent-ended-wealth-based-detention/>.
34. Stan Ingold, *Randolph County Officials Sued for Violating Constitutional Rights*, Alabama Public Radio (May 18, 2017), available at <http://www.apr.org/post/randolph-county-officials-sued-violating-constitutional-rights#stream/0>.
35. Anna Claire Vollers, *Too poor to make bail: Alabama forced to reform "two-tiered" jail system*, AL.com (Oct. 11, 2017), available at https://www.al.com/news/index.ssf/2017/10/too_poor_to_make_bail_alabama.html.

Pretrial Risk Assessment

36. Laura and John Arnold Foundation, *Developing a National Model for Pretrial Risk Assessment* (Nov. 2013), available at https://www.arnoldfoundation.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/LJAF-research-summary_PSA-Court_4_1.pdf.
37. Megan Stevenson, Ph.D., *Assessing Risk Assessment in Action*, Minnesota Law Review (forthcoming), available at https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3016088.
38. John Monahan and Jennifer L. Skeem, *Risk Assessment in Criminal Sentencing*, *Annu. Rev. Clin. Psychol.* (2016), available at <http://risk-resilience.berkeley.edu/sites/default/files/journal-articles/files/annurev-clinpsy-021815-092945.pdf>.
39. Marie Van Nostrand, Ph.D., *Race and Gender Neutral Pretrial Risk Assessment, Release Recommendations, and Supervision* (November 2016), available at <https://www.dcjs.virginia.gov/sites/dcjs.virginia.gov/files/publications/corrections/race-and-gender-neutral-pretrial-risk-assessment-release-recommendations-and-supervision.pdf>.
40. Adam Neufeld, *In Defense of Risk-Assessment Tools*, The Marshall Project (Oct. 22, 2017), available at <https://www.themarshallproject.org/2017/10/22/in-defense-of-risk-assessment-tools>.
41. Richard Berk, et al., *Fairness in Criminal Justice Risk Assessments: The State of the Art* (March 2017), available at <https://arxiv.org/abs/1703.09207>.
42. Alex P. Miller, *Want Less-Biased Decisions? Use Algorithms*. Harvard Business Review (July 26, 2018), available at https://hbr.org/2018/07/want-less-biased-decisions-use-algorithms?utm_source=twitter&utm_medium=social&utm_campaign=hbr.
43. Gideon's Promise, National Legal Aid & Defender Association, National Association for Public Defense, National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers, and the NLADA American Council of Chief Defenders, *Joint Statement in Support of the Use of Pretrial Risk Assessment Instruments* (May 10, 2017), available at

<http://www.publicdefenders.us/files/Defenders%20Statement%20on%20Pretrial%20RAI%20May%202017.pdf>.

44. Jennifer Skeem and Christopher Lowenkamp, *Risk, Race, and Recidivism: Predictive Bias and Disparate Impact* (June 2016), available at https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2687339&download=yes.
45. *Statement by the Laura and John Arnold Foundation in Response to the Report on Bail Reform Issued by the Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights* (July 31, 2018), available at <https://www.arnoldfoundation.org/statement-by-the-laura-and-john-arnold-foundation-in-response-to-the-report-on-bail-reform-issued-by-the-leadership-conference-on-civil-and-human-rights/>.
46. Anthony W. Flores, Christopher T. Lowenkamp, and Kristin Bechtel, *False Positives, False Negatives, and False Analyses A Rejoinder to “Machine Bias: There’s Software Used Across the Country to Predict Future Criminals. And it’s Biased Against Blacks,”* Federal Probation, vol. 80, n. 2 (2016) (article begins on page 38), available at http://www.uscourts.gov/sites/default/files/usct10024-fedprobation-sept2016_0.pdf.
47. Sam Corbett-Davies, et al., *A computer program used for bail and sentencing decisions was labeled biased against blacks. It’s actually not that clear*, (Washington Post) (Oct. 17, 2016), available at https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/monkey-cage/wp/2016/10/17/can-an-algorithm-be-racist-our-analysis-is-more-cautious-than-propublicas/?utm_term=.9a11d919c964.

Pretrial Risk Assessments - Concerns

48. *Shared Statement of Civil Rights Concerns on The Use of Pretrial Risk Assessment Instruments*, Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights (July 30, 2018), available at: <https://leadershipconferenceedfund.org/pretrial-risk-assessment/>.
49. *Six Things to Know about Algorithm-Based Decision-Making Tools*, Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights (July 30, 2018), available at: <http://civilrightsdocs.info/pdf/criminal-justice/Pretrial-Risk-Assessment-6Things.pdf>.
50. *Statement from Nicholas Turner on Leadership Conference’s Risk Assessment Principles* (July 30, 2018), available at <https://www.vera.org/newsroom/press-releases/statement-from-nicholas-turner-on-leadership-conferences-risk-assessment-principles>.
51. Brandon Buskey and Andrea Woods, *Making Sense of Pretrial Risk Assessments*, The Champion, National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers (projected publication August 15, 2018).
52. John Logan Koepke and David G. Robinson, *Danger Ahead: Risk Assessment and the Future of Bail Reform*, available at https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3041622.
53. Julia Angwin, et al., *Machine Bias: There’s Software Used Across the Country to Predict Future Criminals. And it’s Biased Against Blacks*, ProPublica, (May 23, 2016), available

- at <https://www.propublica.org/article/machine-bias-risk-assessments-in-criminal-sentencing>.
54. Julia Angwin, et al., *Bias in Criminal Risk Scores Mathematically Inevitable, Researchers Say*, (ProPublica) (Dec. 30, 2016), available at <https://www.propublica.org/article/bias-in-criminal-risk-scores-is-mathematically-inevitable-researchers-say>.
55. *Bail Reform and Risk Assessment: The Cautionary Tale of Federal Sentencing*, 131 Harv. L. Rev. 1125 (Feb. 9, 2018), available at: <https://harvardlawreview.org/2018/02/bail-reform-and-risk-assessment-the-cautionary-tale-of-federal-sentencing/>.
56. Sandra G. Mayson, *Dangerous Defendants*, 127 Yale L. J. 490 (Jan. 2018), available at <https://www.yalelawjournal.org/article/dangerous-defendants>.
57. Chelsea Barabas, et al., *An Open Letter to the Members of the Massachusetts Legislature Regarding the Adoption of Actuarial Risk Assessment Tools in the Criminal Justice System* (Nov. 9, 2017), available at <https://medium.com/berkman-klein-center/the-following-letter-signed-by-harvard-and-mit-based-faculty-staff-and-researchers-chelsea-7a0cf3e925e9>.
58. Chelsea Barabas, et al., *Interventions over Predictions: Reframing the Ethical Debate for Actuarial Risk Assessment* (2018), available at <http://proceedings.mlr.press/v81/barabas18a/barabas18a.pdf>.
59. Sonja B. Starr, *Evidence-Based Sentencing and the Scientific Rationalization of Discrimination*, 66 Stan. L. Rev. 803 (April 2014), available at <https://www.stanfordlawreview.org/print/article/evidence-based-sentencing-and-the-scientific-rationalization-of-discrimination/>.
60. Bernard E. Harcourt, *Risk as a Proxy for Race*, Univ. of Chicago Law & Econ. Olin Working Paper No. 535 (Sept. 2010), available at https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1677654.